The Aryan Invasion
Theory Myth

Sibin Mohan
HSC Discussion Series | Feb 21, 2007
NC State University
Indo-Aryan “Migration”

- Note: idea of an “invasion” has all but been ruled out.
- Basically a theory originating from Linguists:
  - Indo-European Languages were introduced to the subcontinent
  - Migrants from Eurasian plains
- Archeological data indicates a shift of settlements
  - From the Indus Valley to the south east
  - During 2nd Century BCE.
  - Note: Not indicative of any earlier migrations!
- “Aryan Invasion theory” created by Max Mueller
  - Date of “invasion”: 1500 – 1200 BCE
  - This was before knowledge of even the Indus Valley Civilization!
- Some scholars estimate “revised” date: 1700 BCE.
Linguistic Argument

- Larger diversity of languages ⇒ point of origin
  - Larger diversity in Europe
  - Hence, origin of Indo-European (IE) Languages ⇒ Europe!
- False!
- Lachmi Dhar introduced the “conservation principle”
  - Area of least linguistic change ⇒ point of origin
  - Because it has experienced least interference.
  - Theory defended by noted linguists (Talageri, Elst, Kazanas, etc.)
- Also, scholars have shown that large populations/areas
  - Can change linguistic affiliations
  - Without original population being wiped out
Aryans, Sanskrit, etc.

  - Misinterpretation; Aryan means “righteous” or “noble”
  - Rig Veda has hymns, such as
    “We pray to Indra to give glory by which the Dasyus may become Aryans”
    - This indicates that “Aryanism” was not attained by birth.

- Sanskrit
  - Originally considered to be the mother of IE languages
  - Now shown not to be true
  - It probably shares a common ancestor with European languages
  - This is shown as evidence of Indo-Aryan migration!

- Fallacy!
Sanskrit

- No link between...
  - Sanskrit not being “mother” language and
  - Indian subcontinent not being origin of IE languages
- Indian links to a “Proto-IE language” ⇒ predates Sanskrit
  - Some people migrated westwards and it evolved into *Germanic* languages
  - Proto-IE evolved in Indian subcontinent to Sanskrit.
- Hence, the IE languages owe their origin to India!
- Sanskrit is also the language used in the **RigVeda**.
  - RigVeda at the center of the debate
  - Supposedly “Aryans” brought over this knowledge to India.
  - timeline and origins under debate
  - Aryan Invasion theorists date it to around 1600 – 1700 BC.
RigVeda

- Problems with RigVeda and its 1600-1700 BC dates
  - No mention of the Indus Valley civilization!
    - Lasted from 4000 BC – 1000 BC.
  - No explicit mention of Migration/homeland
  - Geography of Rig Veda ⇒ repeatedly mentions Seven rivers
    - One of which is “Saraswati” – ran from Himalayas to Arabian Sea
      - 7 km in width at certain locations – difficult to miss!
      - Recent discoveries showed that it existed
      - Died/went underground around 4000 – 3000 BC!
      - Mentioned in Mahabharata (dated before 2000 BC) as “dying river”

- But … the RigVeda was written in 1600-1700 BC!

- Names of places/rivers
  - Sanskrit names or names from derived languages in India
  - Names are from pre-IE languages in Europe.

Hence, IE Languages probably originated in India
Missing in the RigVeda...

- No mention of Silver ⇒ existed in Indus Valley
- Harappan Culture (cities, buildings, bricks) not known
- No mention of Rice/Cotton
  - Cultivated during and post Indus Valley civilization
- *Nakshatra* (developed around 2400 BC) ⇒ not mentioned
  - Lunar system of dividing sky into 27/28 portions
- Hence, RigVeda was composed **before** the Indus Valley
  - Must be at least before 4000 BC!
- But…the RigVeda was written in 1600-1700 BC!
Archeological/Genetic Support

- **No archeological evidence** of Aryan Invasion/Migration

- Only in linguistic community and sketchy at that
  - Only theories – no solid proof.

- Examinations of 300 skeletons from Harrappa
  - **No genetic difference** between them and modern Indians
  - Impossible if “invasion” happened around 1700 BC
  - 1700 BC – towards end of Indus Valley Civilization.
  - Hence, not possible if said migration happened!
“Out of Africa” theory

● Stephen Oppenheimer and Bradshaw foundation
● Synthesis of
  ● mtDNA, Y Chromosomes, Archeology, Climatology, Fossils, Cave paintings/indigenous art
● Humans came out of Africa into Indian subcontinent
  ● 85,000 – 75,000 years ago.
  ● And not directly into Europe as previously thought.
● Moved from Indian subcontinent to Europe
  ● 65,000 – 52,000 years ago.
● Moved to central Asia from India and Europe
  ● 45,000 – 40,000 years ago.
Human Evolution

● Homo Neanderthalensis
  ● Appeared 130,000 years ago
  ● Uses spears, cares for sick, buries dead
  ● Has **speech** capabilities

● Homo Sapiens
  ● Appeared 100,000 years ago
  ● First Anatomically modern humans
  ● Agriculture, speech, worship, settlements, etc.
2 + 2 = 4

- Speech capabilities in Humans → 130,000 – 100,000 years ago
- Migration from India to Europe → 65,000 – 52,000 years ago

- Who influenced whom in language creation?
  ⇒ You do the math.

Also, it is inconceivable that a bunch of nomads could take over a mature civilization like the Indus Valley and “teach” them philosophy, religion, agriculture, etc. and “give” them the sophisticated and complex RigVeda!
Thanks !